Genomic Variation and Gene Conversion in Spinal Muscular Atrophy: Implications for Disease Process and Clinical Phenotype

Louise Campbell,¹ Allyson Potter,¹ Jaakko Ignatius,² Victor Dubowitz,³ and Kay Davies¹

¹Genetics Unit, Department of Biochemistry, University of Oxford, Oxford; ²Family Federation of Finland, Department of Medical Genetics, Helsinki; and ³Neuromuscular Unit, Department of Paediatrics, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, Hammersmith Hospital, London

classified, on the basis of age at onset and severity, into sive disorder with variable clinical severity and an overthree types: type I, severe; type II, intermediate; and type all incidence of $1/6,000 - 1/10,000$ (Dubowitz 1995).
III, mild. The critical region in 5013 contains an inverted The disease primarily affects the anterior horn III, mild. The critical region in 5q13 contains an inverted like disease primarily affects the anterior horn cells of repeat harboring several genes, including the survival the spinal cord, degeneration of which results in the spinal cord, degeneration of which results in proxi-
motor neuron (SMN) gene, the neuronal apoptosis in-
mal muscle weakness. SMA is conventionally classified, motor neuron (SMN) gene, the neuronal apoptosis in-
hibitory protein (NAIP) gene, and the p44 gene, which on the basis of age at onset and severity, into three types hibitory protein (NAIP) gene, and the p44 gene, which **encodes a transcription-factor subunit. Deletion of** (Munsat and Davies 1992; Dubowitz 1995). Werdnig-**NAIP and p44 is observed more often in severe SMA,** Hoffman disease, or type I SMA, is the most severe form, but there is no evidence that these genes play a role in the with onset either in utero or during the first few **but there is no evidence that these genes play a role in the** with onset either in utero or during the first few months pathology of the disease. In >90% of all SMA patients, of life. Affected children cannot sit unsuppor **pathology of the disease. In** >90% of all SMA patients, of life. Affected children cannot sit unsupported, and exons 7 and 8 of the telomeric SMN gene (SMNtel) are death usually occurs at <2 years of age. Type II SMA **exons 7 and 8 of the telomeric SMN gene (SMNtel) are** death usually occurs at õ2 years of age. Type II SMA not detectable, and this is also observed in some normal usually manifests within the 1st year of life, and, al-
siblings and parents. Point mutations and gene conver-
though affected children may sit unaided, they do not siblings and parents. Point mutations and gene conver-
 sions in SMNtel suggest that it plays a major role in the achieve the ability to stand or walk independently. The **sions in SMNtel suggest that it plays a major role in the** achieve the ability to stand or walk independently. The disease. To define a correlation between genotype and survival of type II individuals depends on the degree of phenotype, we mapped deletions, using pulsed-field gel respiratory complications. Kugelberg-Welander disease, **phenotype, we mapped deletions, using pulsed-field gel** respiratory complications. Kugelberg-Welander disease, **electrophoresis. Surprisingly, our data show that muta-** or type III SMA, is a less severe form, characterized by tions in SMA types II and III, previously classed as deletions, are in fact due to gene-conversion events in which severity, walk independently, and may have a normal **SMNtel** is replaced by its centromeric counternart. life expectancy. **SMNtel is replaced by its centromeric counterpart,** life expectancy.
SMNcen. This results in a greater number of SMNcen all three forms of childhood SMA map to the same **SMNcen.** This results in a greater number of SMNcen and the forms of childhood SMA map to the same copies in type II and type III patients compared with region on chromosome 5q13 (Brzustowicz et al. 1990; **copies in type II and type III patients compared with** region on chromosome 5q13 (Brzustowicz et al. 1990; type I patients and enables a genotype/phenotype corre-

Gilliam et al. 1990; Melki et al. 1990*a*, 1990*b*). A nu type I patients and enables a genotype/phenotype corre**lation to be made. We also demonstrate individual** ber of YAC physical maps spanning the SMA region **DNA-content variations of several hundred kilobases,** have been published, but it has not been possible to **even in a relatively isolated population from Finland.** generate a consensus map of the region (Francis et al. **This explains why no consensus map of this region has** 1993; Kleyn et al. 1993; Carpten et al. 1994; Melki et **been produced. This DNA variation may be due to a** al. 1994; Roy et al. 1995*b*). This may be due to the midisatellite repeat array, which would promote the obmidisatellite repeat array, which would promote the obsequences, pseudogenes, and retrotransposable ele- **served high deletion and gene-conversion rate.**

Summary Introduction

Autosomal recessive spinal muscular atrophy (SMA) is Spinal muscular atrophy (SMA) is an autosomal reces-

ments, which may make the region unstable (Francis et al. 1993, 1995; Sargent et al. 1994; Theodosiou et al. 1994; Selig et al. 1995). It also harbors a large inverted duplication containing the survival motor neuron gene (SMN) (Lefebvre et al. 1995) and the neuronal apoptosis Received February 26, 1997; accepted for publication April 22, inhibitory-protein gene (NAIP) (Roy et al. 1995*a*) (see Address for correspondence and reprints: Dr. Kay E. Davies, Genet-
ics Unit, Department of Biochemistry, University of Oxford, South 1996) The telomeric SMN gene (SMNtel) differs from ics Unit, Department of Biochemistry, University of Oxford, South 1996). The telomeric SMN gene (SMNtel) differs from Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3QU, United Kingdom. E-mail: kdavies@bi-
och.ox.ac.uk © 1997 by The American Soci 0002-9297/97/6101-0009\$02.00 the two genes to be distinguished either by SSCP analysis

^{1997.} fig. 1*A*). The SMN gene encodes a novel protein with a

normal individuals (Hahnen et al. 1995; Lefebvre et al. that this gene does not play a role in the disease pathol- of SMNtel. ogy. In addition, the protein structure and function ap-
 $\ln \sim 5\%$ of SMA patients, exon 7 of SMNtel is not

pear normal in patients homozygously deleted for the

detectable whereas exon 8 remains intact. (Cobben et al. telomeric p44 gene (Bu¨rglen et al. 1997). 1995; Hahnen et al. 1995; Rodrigues et al. 1995, 1996).

and 8 is observed by PCR-based methods in $>90\%$ of conversion event, resulting in chimeric genes consisting all SMA patients, there has as yet been no correlation of SMNcen exon 7 linked to SMNtel exon 8 (Bussaglia between these apparent deletions and the severity of the et al. 1995; Lefebvre et al. 1995; Devriend et al. 1996; disease, most likely because the extent of deletion cannot Hahnen et al. 1996; van der Steege et al. 1996; Velasco easily be established, because of the presence of et al. 1996; DiDonato et al. 1997; Talbot et al., in press). SMNcen. Nonamplification of NAIP exon 5 is observed The partial gene conversion, not involving the entire gene, more frequently in type I SMA than in types II and III, that occurs in this minority of patients has been observed suggesting the association of larger deletions with type in all SMA severities. Compound heterozygosity of multi-

I (Hahnen et al. 1995; Roy et al. 1995*a;* Wirth et al. 1995; Burlet et al. 1996; Rodrigues et al. 1996; Velasco et al. 1996).

It has been proposed that the SMA phenotype can be modified by the presence of differing numbers of copies of SMNcen. For example, studies have been carried out on the parents of SMA patients to determine the SMNcen:SMNtel dose ratio by densitometry of SSCP bands (Velasco et al. 1996). As obligate carriers, the parents were assumed to possess only one SMNtel gene. The SMNcen:SMNtel dose ratio therefore reflected the number of SMNcen copies. It was found that parents of type II and type III patients carried more copies of SMNcen than were carried by parents of type I patients. Figure 1 A, Schematic representation of the duplicated region However, in control individuals the total number of on chromosome 5q13, containing the SMN and NAIP genes. NAIPY SMNcen copies could not be assessed definitivel $=$ NAIP-pseudogene copy. The p44 gene is not represented, since it a ratio of 1:1 could represent either two telomeric and is not considered a candidate gene for SMA. B, Illustration of the two centromeric genes or one c is not considered a candidate gene for SMA. *B,* Illustration of the two centromeric genes or one copy of each. The types of normal and mutant SMN alleles proposed. Gray-shaded and
unshaded boxes represent SMNcen and SMNtel gene copies, respec-
tively. A gray-shaded box in the SMNtel position represents a gene-
conversion event: SMNtel normal chromosomes and three for SMA chromosomes, and proposed a disease model involving compound het- (Lefebvre et al. 1995) or by enzyme digestion of PCR erozygosity of these alleles. Although the genotype conproducts (van der Steege et al. 1995). Although both taining three SMNcen copies was observed in SMA types genes are transcribed, SMNtel is believed to be the im- II and III, the authors had insufficient evidence to correportant functional copy, since some exons of this gene late an increase in SMNcen copy number with a less are not detectable in SMA patients (Hahnen et al. 1995; severe phenotype. It has also been demonstrated that Lefebvre et al. 1995; Rodrigues et al. 1995, 1996; Mat- the number of alleles of the multicopy marker C272 (or thijs et al. 1996; Velasco et al. 1996). However, SMNcen Ag1CA) is an indicator of severity (DiDonato et al. exons 7 and 8 are also undetectable in a minority of 1994; Melki et al. 1994; Lefebvre et al. 1995; Wirth et al. 1995). Since the C272 marker lies at the 5' end of 1995; Rodrigues et al. 1995; Matthijs et al. 1996). The each SMN gene, it should reflect the number of gene telomeric NAIP gene can be distinguished from its cen- copies. Alleles of C272 are deleted more often in type I tromeric pseudogene counterpart by a PCR test for the SMA than in types II and III, suggesting that fewer SMN presence or absence of exon 5, which only exists within copies remain in type I SMA. However, although the telomeric functional gene. Also contained within the SMNcen copy number is implicated in the variable seinverted duplicated region is the gene encoding p44, a verity observed in SMA, none of the methods employed subunit of the basal transcription factor TFIIH (Humb- to date enable a definitive assessment of SMN copy numert et al. 1994). Deletion or interruption of this gene ber to be made both in SMA patients and in control is observed in 73% of type I SMA patients, but the individuals, and no method can distinguish between the observation of deletions in parents and controls suggests number of copies of SMNcen and the number of copies

detectable whereas exon 8 remains intact. (Cobben et al. Although lack of amplification of SMNtel exons 7 SMN genes in such individuals are the result of a geneof SMNcen exon 7 linked to SMNtel exon 8 (Bussaglia ences in clinical expression of the disease (Wirth et al. region, blood was obtained from 7 unrelated Caucasian 1995; Talbot et al. 1996; DiDonato et al. 1997), and it control individuals, as well as from 10 healthy blood may be that combinations of SMN gene deletions leading donors originating from northern Finland. Informed to severe alleles and gene conversions leading to mild consent was obtained from all subjects prior to samalleles will result in variability of severity. pling.

Nonamplification of exons of SMNtel has also been described in asymptomatic siblings and parents of af-

SMN and NAIP PCR Deletion Analysis fected individuals (Cobben et al. 1995; Hahnen et al. SMN exon 7 and 8 deletion analysis was performed 1995; Wang et al. 1996). This observation has cast some by the PCR and enzyme-digestion method described by doubt on the role of SMNtel as the causative gene for van der Steege et al. (1995). PCR was performed by SMA. We propose that gene-conversion events may have use of primers spanning SMN exons 7 and 8, and the led to the replacement of SMNtel by SMNcen in such products were digested with *Dra*I and *Dde*I, respecindividuals, thereby leading to the existence of four cop- tively. Digested products were run on 2.5% agarose gels, ies of SMNcen. Since SMNcen is thought to produce a and patients were scored as to their deletion status. small level of fully functional protein, four copies of this NAIP exon 5 deletion analysis was performed by the gene may produce enough functional protein to result method described by Roy et al. (1995*a*). Duplex PCR in a normal phenotype (see Discussion). was performed by use of primers specific to NAIP exons

crepancies exist in the YAC maps from different groups, tive for NAIP exon 5, exon 13 being an internal control. and the exact copy number of the genes in the region cannot be reliably determined. Although the PCR-based PFGE deletion analysis of SMN exons is an extremely useful Genomic DNA was prepared from lymphocytes emindicator of affected status, it cannot detect the extent bedded in 0.6% low-gelling-temperature agarose blocks of deletion. We therefore chose to investigate gene copy at a concentration of 10^7 cells/ml. After cell lysis and number and the extent of DNA deletion in SMA pa- protein degradation in 0.5 M EDTA (pH 8.0) containing tients, using pulsed-field gel electrophoresis (PFGE). 1% SDS and 0.25 mg proteinase K,/ml at 50°C for 48 This also allowed us to test the hypothesis that the vari-
h, blocks were incubated at 37°C for 2 h in Tris-EDTA ability in the physical maps might be due to genomic containing 2 mM Pefabloc (Boehringer Mannheim), to

SMN copy number by PFGE, enabling the identification on 1.2% pulsed-field agarose gels for 40 h (pulse time 70 of those bands representing telomeric and centromeric s), by use of an LKB 2015 Pulsaphor system apparatus copies. We show the presence of a high degree of varia- (Pharmacia). DNA was transferred to Hybond N^+ memtion specific to the SMA region, in which fragment size brane (Amersham) by capillary transfer in 0.4 M NaOH. can vary by as much as 400 kb between individuals. Probes used in the hybridization of pulsed-field gels were This variation is inherited in a Mendelian fashion and prepared by PCR amplification using primers to exons exists even in a highly inbred population. Its existence 3 and 8 of the SMN gene and to exon 5 of the NAIP explains the lack of correlation between different physi-
gene. Amplified products were gel-purified (Geneclean; cal maps of the region and suggests a high rate of change Bio 101) and then were labeled to high specific activity in this region of the genome. The data obtained allow by random priming (Pharmacia). Hybridization was perus to make a hypothesis about the relationship between formed at 65° C in Church buffer (0.5 M NaHPO₄ [pH genotype and the severity of the SMA phenotype. 7.2]/1 mM EDTA/7% SDS) overnight. Filters were

Material and Methods

DNA Resources **Results**

All patients conformed to internationally agreed diagnostic criteria (Munsat and Davies 1992). Lymphoblas- Polymorphism in the SMA Region toid cell lines (LCLs) were available from 15 unrelated In order to investigate the degree of variability in the SMA patients, of whom 5 were type I (1 from a consan-
SMA region, probes corresponding to exon 3 of SMN guineous family), 7 were type II, and 3 were type III (SMN3) and to exon 5 of NAIP (NAIP5) were used (1 consanguineous). Affected siblings and other family for hybridization of genomic DNA digested with raremembers were available from some families. LCL con- cutting restriction enzymes. Figure 2 shows the analysis trol samples were available from two non-SMA families. of seven unrelated Caucasian normal individuals whose

ple alleles has been proposed to account for the differ- In order to study the genomic variation of the SMA

In summary, the SMA region is highly complex, dis-
5 and 13, and patients were scored as positive or nega-

variation in the normal population. increase inactivate proteinase K. Blocks were digested overnight In this paper we demonstrate the direct assessment of with 40 U restriction enzyme, and the DNA wasanalyzed washed to a final stringency of $0.5 \times$ SSC/0.1% SDS at 65°C.

Figure 2 Analysis of normal individuals. *Eag*I (*a*–*c*) and *Bss*HII (*d*–*f*) digests of DNA of seven unrelated Caucasian normal individuals, hybridized with SMN3 (*a* and *d*), NAIP5 (*b* and *e*), and utrophin (*c* and *f*) probes. Sizes (in kbp) relate to lambda-ladder PFG markers.

The same exon does not contain any *Bss*HII sites. Each These data suggest that restriction sites for both enzymes

DNA was digested with either *Bss*HII (fig. 2*a*–*c*) or *Eag*I band again relates to at least one copy of the gene. Thus, (fig. 2*d*–*f*). SMN exon 3 contains neither a *Bss*HII nor it is possible to identify the SMN and NAIP cohybridizan *Eag*I restriction site. Each band observed must there- ing bands as telomeric copies. The number of SMNtel fore relate to at least one copy of the gene. In some genes in the individuals shown is generally two. The cases, where the band intensity appears greater than individual whose DNA is shown in lane 6 has three normal, it may be that more than one band of the same bands hybridizing to NAIP5 but still has two SMNtel size is present, as is likely to be the case in lanes 4 and copies, since only two of the bands cohybridize with 5 of figure 2*d* and *e*. Thus, hybridization with SMN3 SMN3. This is the case with both *Eag*I and *Bss*HII. In shows that the total number of SMN gene copies among the case of *Eag*I, the bands appear to be very similar in normal individuals varies from three to four (fig. 2*a* and size, but, when autoradiographs of both hybridizations *d*). A high degree of variability was observed in the size were overlaid, one of the three bands was clearly of a of hybridizing bands, the *Eag*I bands varying in size different size. Many NAIP pseudogenes consisting of from \sim 200 kb to \sim 600 kb in unrelated individuals. The various exons exist in the genome, and the third band same filters were subsequently hybridized with NAIP5, may represent such a sequence (Roy et al. 1995*a*). may represent such a sequence (Roy et al. 1995*a*). We which is contained only within the telomeric region of have subsequently observed three NAIP5 bands in 1/10 the SMA locus and which is lacking in the centromeric other control individuals. The pattern of bands observed NAIP pseudogene.(fig. 2*b* and *e*) Exon 5 of the NAIP with either *Eag*I or *Bss*HII is very similar within each gene contains an *Eag*I restriction site that we have found individual, although the larger size range with *Bss*HII to be methylated in genomic DNA (data not shown). indicates that this enzyme cuts outside the *Eag*I sites.

Mendelian Inheritance of SMA-Region Polymorphism

In order to determine whether the instability observed is heritable, we analyzed eight members of a non-SMA family, the results of which are presented in figure 3. This *Bss*HII digest was hybridized with the SMN3 (fig. 3*a*) and NAIP5 probes (fig. 3*b*). Seven members of the family have four SMN copies, two of which, because of cohybridization of SMN3 and NAIP5, are designated telomeric. The individual whose DNA is shown in lane 5 shows only two SMN copies, one of which is telomeric, but he is believed to have inherited the same-size bands from both parents. When this filter was hybridized with the utrophin probe, a band of lesser intensity was observed in this lane, both indicating that less DNA **Figure 4** Analysis of variation in northern Finnish control indiis present and accounting for the lack of dosage differ-
expansive digests of DNA of 10 unrelated control individuals,
ence (data not shown). These data show that the varia-
hybridized with SMN3 (a) and NAIP5 (b) probes. L tion in band size is inherited in a Mendelian show DNA from the same individual, run on different gels to allow

Variability within an Inbred Population

In view of the high degree of variation in the normal population, it was of interest to determine whether a mutations might be expected to exist, would show a highly inbred population, in which only a few founder lower degree of fragment-size variability. Since a number

Figure 3 Mendelian inheritance of the variation in a non-SMA family. *BssHII* digests of DNA of eight members of a non-SMA family, family. *Bss*HII digests of DNA of eight members of a non-SMA family, PCR Deletion Analysis of SMN and NAIP hybridized with SMN3 (*a*) and NAIP5 (*b*) probes. Lane 1, Father. Lane 2, Mother. Lanes 3–8, Offspring. Sizes (in kbp) relate to lambda- Deletion analysis of the SMN and NAIP genes was ladder PFG markers. performed on the patients to be analyzed by PFGE, as

hybridized with SMN3 (*a*) and NAIP5 (*b*) probes. Lanes 8 and 9 comparison. Sizes (in kbp) relate to lambda-ladder or yeast-chromo- fashion. some PFG markers.

hower degree of fragment-size variability. Since a number of the individuals in our patient database originate from Finland, we chose to investigate the size variability in controls from one region of this inbred population.

Figure 4 shows the results obtained when *Eag*I digests of DNA from 10 northern Finnish non-SMA individuals were hybridized to the SMN3 (fig. 4*a*) and NAIP5 probes (fig. 4*b*). The same type of variability was observed as was seen in the seven non-Finnish control samples, and the total number of SMN copies again varied from three to four. SMNtel copies in these controls varied between one and three. The individual whose DNA is shown in lanes 8 and 9 (DNA of the same individual is present in both lanes), who has only one NAIP5 hybridizing band, may be a carrier for the disease, having only one SMNtel gene, or may have more than one fragment of this size. The size of *Eag*I bands in Finnish control individuals varies between \sim 180 kb and \sim 600 kb, a size range similar to that observed in the non-Finnish controls (see fig. 2*d* and *e*). This amount of variability in such an inbred population is indicative of a high degree of instability within the SMA region.

as to their deletion status for SMN exons 7 and 8 inde- ignated telomeric, because of cohybridization with pendently. Patients were scored as positive or negative NAIP5. for NAIP exon 5, the telomeric-gene marker. A summary In conclusion, type I chromosomes appear to result

same five SMA type I patients as were analyzed by the PCR deletion method (see table 1). A blot containing be expected to be \sim 70 kb. *Eag*I digests of the DNA of five SMA type I patients was hybridized to the SMN3 probe (fig. 5*a*). The individual SMN Copy Number in SMA Type II and Type III whose DNA is shown in lane 5 is from a consanguineous P atients family. The total number of SMN gene copies was as-
SMN copy number was investigated in the same seven

described in the Methods section. Patients were scored SMN3 and SMN8. Two of these SMN copies were des-

of these results is presented in table 1. from the deletion of a large genomic region, encom-*SMN Copy Number in SMA Type I Patients*

Since the distance between SMNtel and the telomeric

The copy number of SMN was investigated in the NAIP gene has been estimated to be ~20 kb (Lefebyre NAIP gene has been estimated to be \sim 20 kb (Lefebvre et al. 1995), the minimum size of such a deletion would

sessed directly from the number of bands visible. Subse- type II and three type III patients as were analyzed by quent hybridization to the NAIP5 probe allowed identi- the PCR deletion method (see table 1). Southern blots fication of cohybridizing bands as telomeric copies (fig. of *Eag*I digests of DNA of these patients were hybridized 5*b*). Type I individuals carry one or two SMN copies, to the SMN3 probe. The seven type II individuals and of the centromeric type only, since none show cohybridi- two of the three type III SMA individuals carry two or zation of NAIP5. This agrees with the PCR deletion data three SMN copies, one of which must exist within the (see table 1). So far, it had been assumed that any SMN telomeric duplicated region, because of cohybridization band not cohybridizing with NAIP exon 5 would be of NAIP5 (fig. 6*a* and *b*). The individual whose DNA centromeric. To confirm this, a probe specific to SMN is shown in lane 1 (SMA type III) is a patient from a exon 8 was hybridized to the same filter, and hybridiza- consanguineous family, who shows only one SMN tion in the affected individuals was indeed observed only band, although it is of increased intensity, suggesting to the bands previously believed to be centromeric (fig. more than one copy of the same size. Hybridization of 5*c*). The control individual whose DNA is shown in other probes to this filter indicated a slight increase in figure 5 showed four SMN bands, on hybridization to the amount of DNA in this lane compared with the

Table 1

^a Designation consists of SMA type (roman numeral) and number assigned to individual (arabic numeral) and correlates with that given in figures 5 and 6.

 b A plus sign (+) denotes presence of a PCR product; and a minus sign (-) denotes absence of a PCR product.

contains at least two SMNcen copies. This patient does not carry a telomeric band, and it cannot be determined whether the functional NAIP gene has been lost as a result of a deletion or as a result of a gene-conversion event. Thus, in all type II and type III patients except the patient whose DNA is shown in lane 1 (SMA type III), both hybridization and PCR deletion analysis suggest the presence of NAIP exon 5. If deletion of the telomeric duplicated region has occurred in these patients, it is not as large a deletion as is seen in type I SMA, since NAIP exon 5 remains. In conclusion, the total number of SMN copies in type II and type III individuals appears to be greater than that in type I.

Gene Conversion of SMNtel to SMNcen in Type II and Type III Chromosomes

SMN PCR deletion analysis showed an absence of amplification of SMNtel exons 7 and 8 in six of seven type II patients and in all three type III patients, suggesting deletion of these exons (see table 1). It was there-
figure 6 Analysis of SMN gene copy number in SMA type II
or expected that the SMN exon 8-specific probe and type III patients: Eagl digests of DNA of seven SMA t would hybridize only to the SMNcen bands in these individuals and three SMA type III individuals, hybridized with SMN3 patients. As can be seen in figure 6c, this is not the case; (a), NAIP5 (b), and SMN8 (c) probes. Lane 1 (SMA type II) shows
the SMN8 probe hybridizes to the telomeric band as DNA of a patient whose phenotype is considere SMNtel is not deleted. This discrepancy in the data markers.

could be explained if the SMNtel gene was not deleted but, rather, was replaced by a copy of SMNcen by a mechanism such as gene conversion (see Discussion). Absence of SMNtel exon 7 but presence of SMNtel exon 8 was detected for the patient whose DNA is shown in lane 4 of figure 6, suggesting that a partial gene conversion has occurred.

Discussion

The data presented in this paper demonstrate that a high degree of variability between individuals exists in the SMA genomic region. In SMA types II and III, the PCR-detected mutations previously classed as deletions are likely to be the result of gene-conversion events, and this results in an increase in SMNcen copies, SMNtel having undergone gene conversion to SMNcen, which correlates with severity of SMA phenotype.

We have shown that a genomic size variation in the **Figure 5** Analysis of SMN gene copy number in SMA type I SMA gene region occurs in the normal population as patients: *Eag*I digests of DNA of five SMA type I patients, hybridized well as in SMA patients and that it is inherited in a with SMN3 (*a*), NAIP5 (*b*), and SMN8 (*c*) probes. Lane 5 shows Mendelian fashion. The Finnish control samples used in
DNA from a patient from a consanguineous family. con = control this study originate from the province DNA from a patient from a consanguineous family. con = control this study originate from the province of Oulu in north-
individual. Sizes (in kbp) relate to lambda-ladder PFG markers. ern Finland, where several autosomal r belonging to the Finnish disease heritage are known to be enriched. These include congenital chloride diarrhea,
for the extra intensity observed on SMN exon 3 and
exon 8 hybridization, and we conclude that this band
generglycinemia, and northern epilepsy (Leisti et al. 1990;

and type III patients: EagI digests of DNA of seven SMA type II

SMA is also observed in this region, the birth incidence from the NAIP exon 5 deletion data. of SMA with onset at age \leq 12 mo being 1/7,100 and We have shown that nonconsanguineous type II and the estimated minimum carrier frequency being 1/42 type III SMA patients carry two or three copies of the the estimated minimum carrier frequency being $1/42$ (Ignatius 1992). The observation of genomic variability SMN gene, one of which, by cohybridization with the in the SMA region of this highly inbred Finnish popula- NAIP exon 5 probe, appeared to be telomeric in origin. tion indicates a high degree of instability within this PCR deletion analysis had revealed a lack of amplificaregion. In view of these data, it is possible to speculate tion of SMNtel exons 7 and 8, but hybridization of an on the existence of a midisatellite type of repeated se- SMN exon 8 probe to the telomeric band in these paquence, the expansion and contraction of which, by a tients suggested that this duplicated region still posmethod such as unequal crossing-over, could result in sessed a copy of SMN exon 8. Since the SMNtel and the formation of alleles differing in size by multiples of SMNcen exons 7 and 8 are easily distinguishable by the the repeat size. One such sequence has been reported to PCR and enzyme-digestion method used in the deletion exist at a single locus on chromosome 1q, and PFGE analysis, we suggest that the exon 8 in question is indeed has shown the presence of allelic polymorphic fragments centromeric in origin. We propose that type II and type varying in size by as much as 250 kb, depending on the III SMA mutant chromosomes occur as a result of geneenzymes used (Nakamura et al. 1987). Two such alleles conversion events in which SMNtel is converted to were observed in each individual. If a copy of a midisat- SMNcen. In this way, patients do not possess a funcellite sequence exists associated with each SMN gene, tional SMNtel gene, although no physical DNA deletion we would expect to see four such variable alleles, as has occurred. Other genome regions containing dupliindeed were observed when we used SMN gene probes. cated genes show a degree of gene-sequence conversion The presence of such a sequence would greatly enhance in those patients in whom gene deletion is not observed the instability of the SMA region and could lead to an (Collier et al. 1989). increase in the mutation rate, since the repeat could me- The number of copies of SMNcen is greater in types diate mutations such as gene-deletion and -conversion II and III than in type I, since SMNtel copies are not events, resulting in the disease. Although the mechanism deleted but are converted to SMNcen. The greater numof gene conversion is not known, the presence of repeat ber of SMNcen copies may serve to ameliorate the SMA units may facilitate alignment of nonhomologous phenotype in the less severe phenotypes, types II and III. strands, allowing sequence conversion, when one repeat Several groups have tested this hypothesis, using various unit is used as template for DNA repair following strand techniques, including investigation of the deletion of albreakage. **leles of the multicopy marker C272**, which is contained

Our data substantiate those of other groups and suggest that the majority of type I SMA cases do indeed 1994; Melki et al. 1994; Lefebvre et al. 1995; Wirth et result from large-scale deletions, extending over \geq 70 kb al. 1995). Correlation of the presence of fewer C272 and encompassing the SMN and NAIP genes. Our data alleles in type I SMA compared with types II and III also show that type I SMA is characterized by the pres- suggested that decreased copy number of C272 alleles ence of one or two SMNcen genes only. The lack of and, therefore, of SMN—led to an increase in phenohybridization of the NAIP exon 5 probe to any band typic severity. Wirth et al. also proposed a model based suggests that no telomeric genes exist in the type I SMA on the existence of mild and severe disease alleles and families examined. \blacksquare on the suggestion that compound heterozygosity of these

the disease. It may be that, as a result of its proximity et al. (1996) employed densitometry of SSCP bands to to this gene, NAIP is coincidentally deleted along with observe an increased number of SMNcen copies in par-SMNtel and that its presence or absence has no effect ents of type II and type III patients, compared with partively, NAIP deletion may contribute to the severity of was used to obtain an SMNtel:SMNcen ratio of gene the phenotype, by generating an effect additive to that of copies (Schwartz et al. 1997). Although proposing a SMNtel deletion. Indeed, deletion of NAIP is associated model in which a number of normal and SMA haplomild forms of the disease. In this study, the presence of disease severity, those authors were unable to correlate extra loci containing NAIP exon 5 was suggested in the number of SMNcen copies to severity. In addition, 2/17 control individuals. Such a finding, even in a small it has been proposed that compound heterozygosity of number of samples, implies that the deletion rate for different disease alleles gives rise to the observation of

de la Chapelle 1993). A high frequency of childhood this gene could be higher than that previously predicted

within the 5' end of each SMN gene (DiDonato et al. alleles in type I SMA compared with types II and III Two possibilities exist to explain the role of NAIP in alleles results in varying severities of the disease. Velasco on the disease phenotype. Deletion of NAIP exon 5 is ents of type I patients, and to suggest that this correlated observed in 2% of SMA carriers and so can be associated with a disease of lower severity in type II and type III with a normal phenotype (Roy et al. 1995*a*). Alterna-

offspring. In a further study, solid-phase minisequencing more often with severe SMA than with intermediate or types exist, which, in combination, give rise to variable different SMA severities within one family (Talbot et al. affecting this region result in SMA. Patients have been

of four SMA alleles, consisting of deletion of SMNtel in motif (Lefebvre et al. 1995; Talbot et al. 1997). Other addition to presence of one or no copies of SMNcen, or mutations result in premature truncation of the SMN conversion of SMNtel to SMNcen in addition to pres- protein (Bussaglia et al. 1995; Brahe et al. 1996; Parsons ence of one or no copies of SMNcen. Figure 1*B* shows et al. 1996). Thus, SMA patients with either deletion of a schematic representation of these alleles. Combina- SMNtel or gene conversion of SMNtel to SMNcen will tions of these disease alleles would give rise to SMA produce a smaller-than-normal amount of functional phenotypes of varying severities; type I, for example, SMN protein, the amount being dependent on the numwould be the result of two chromosomes in which ber of SMNcen genes present. SMNtel has been deleted. On the basis of this model, It has been shown that the level of SMN protein defor instance, this situation would be represented by a tectable on a western blot is much reduced in SMA type genotype consisting of SMA alleles 1,2 or 2,2 (see fig. I (Lefebvre et al. 1996). This result is in accordance with 1*B*). SMA type I patients homozygous for the most se- our observation that a minimal number (one or two) of vere allele, consisting of deletion of SMNtel and the SMNcen copies are carried by SMA type I individuals. absence of SMNcen gene (genotype 1,1) are not ob- In contrast, an almost normal amount of SMN protein served, suggesting that this combination would be lethal is produced in type III patients, indicating a correlation in utero. A similar model recently has been proposed by between the amount of SMN protein and the clinical DiDonato et al. (1997), who observed a strong associa- expression of the disease. The size difference between tion between the milder forms of SMA (types II and III) the proteins translated from the SMNcen full-length and and partial gene-conversion events not involving exon truncated transcripts is only 17 amino acids. It is not 8. However, it should be noted that other groups have possible by conventional western analysis to distinguish observed these events also in type I SMA (Hahnen et al. between the two resultant proteins. The observation of 1996; van der Steege et al. 1996; Velasco et al. 1996; an almost normal level of SMN protein in type III sug-Talbot et al., in press). The observation of one NAIP5- gests that the truncated protein is indeed translated. It specific band in all but one of the type II and type III appears that, because of the presence of a greater numpatients examined, in contrast to the two bands present ber of SMNcen copies, an increased amount of fully in most normal individuals, suggests that these patients functional protein is produced as the severity of the disare compound heterozygotes with one deleted allele and ease decreases. one gene-converted allele. Although we were unable to In this study we have highlighted a difference, in the include in this study any type I patients who retain an mechanism of formation, between SMA type I chromointact NAIP gene, it would be of interest to examine somes and those of types II and III. We have shown that such patients, in order to determine whether the lack of gene conversion plays a major role in type II and type amplification of SMNtel exons in such a case would be III SMA. We propose that an increase in SMNcen copy due to deletion or to gene conversion. The model pro- number leads to a decrease in severity of the disease, by posed by Emery (1991), in which one normal allele ex- the production of increased levels of functional SMN ists and combinations of at least four mutant alleles protein, low levels of which are encoded by this gene. could account for SMA types I–III, would have to be If this proves to be the case, as is also indicated by modified to include two normal alleles, consisting of one the demonstration of the importance of SMNcen copy SMNtel gene and either one or no SMNcen genes (see number in severity when the marker C272 (or Ag1CA) fig. 1*B*). is used, then the up-regulation of this centromeric gene

SMNtel results in production of a full-length transcript, in SMA. thereby encoding a fully functional protein. SMNcen transcription, on the other hand, results in an alternative transcript lacking exon 7 and in a significant decrease **Acknowledgments** in levels of the full-length transcript. The alternative
transcript is spliced in-frame from exon 6 to exon 8,
generating a truncated protein. The importance of exons
6 and 7 has been suggested recently by Talbot et al.
(1 sine-glycine $(Y - G)$ dodecapeptide motif in the region of this research. This work was supported by the Muscular Dystrophy Group the protein encoded by exons 6 and 7 is crucial to the trophy Association (USA), the Muscular correct functioning of the protein and that mutations (UK) and the Medical Research Council (UK).

1996). described with mutations predicted to disrupt this region The data presented in this study suggest the existence and that would therefore be expected to disrupt this

Lefebvre et al. (1995) showed that transcription of could hold the key to future therapeutic advances

- Brahe C, Clermont O, Zappata S, Tiziano F, Melki J, Neri G Francis MJ, Nesbit MA, Theodosiou AM, Rodrigues NR,
- Brzustowicz LM, Lehner T, Castilla LH, Penchaszadeh GK, nomics 27:366–369 Wilhelmsen KC, Daniels R, Davies KE, et al (1990) Genetic Gilliam TC, Brzustowicz lM, Castilla LH, Lehner T, Penchas-
- Bürglen L, Seroz T, Miniou P, Lefebvre S, Burlet P, Munnich atrophy. Nature 345:823-825 A, Pequignot EV, et al (1997) The gene encoding p44, a Hahnen E, Forkert R, Marke C, Rudnik-Schöneborn S, Schön-
- nich A, Melki J (1996) Large scale deletions of the 5q13 4:1927–1933
region are specific to Werdnig-Hoffmann disease. I Med Hahnen E, Schönling J, Rudnik-Schöneborn S, Zerres K, Wirth region are specific to Werdnig-Hoffmann disease. J Med
- Cruaud C, Urtizberea JA, et al (1995) A frame-shift deletion sights into molecular mechanisms resp
in the survival motor neuron gene in Spanish spinal muscu-
ease. Am J Hum Genet 59:1057–1065 in the survival motor neuron gene in Spanish spinal muscu-
Iar atrophy patients. Nat Genet 11:335–337
IM, Moncollin V (1994) p44 and p34 subunits of the BTF2/
IM, Moncollin V (1994) p44 and p34 subunits of the BTF2/
- contig of the region containing the spinal muscular atrophy
gene (SMA): identification of an unstable region. Genomics
24:351–356
Land. PhD thesis, University of Tampere. Acta Univ Tamper-
-
- Cobben JM, van der Steege G, Grootscholten P, de Visser M,

Scheffer H, and Sh Dheistons of has A, bule 258. Tuneers. Find the the paper Scheffer H, Buys CHCM (1995) Deletions of the survival emsists A, wol 358. Tampere.
-
-
-
- Ag1-CA alleles and severity of autosomal recessive proximal Genet 33:469–474
spinal muscular atrophy. Am J Hum Genet 55:1218–1229 Melki I. Abdelhak S. S
-
- Emery AEH (1991) Clinical and genetic heterogeneity in spinal $767 768$ muscular atrophy—the multiple allele model. Neuromuscul Melki J, Lefebvre S, Bürglen L, Burlet P, Clermont O, Millas-
Disord 1:307–308 seau P, Reboullet S, et al (1994) De novo and inherited
- doulou Z, Daniels RJ, Monaco AP, et al (1993) A contig of Science 264:1474 –1477

References non-chimaeric YACs containing the spinal muscular atrophy gene in 5q13. Hum Mol Genet 2:1161–1167

- (1996) Frameshift mutation in the survival motor neuron Campbell L, Christodoulou Z, Qureshi SJ, et al (1995) Mapgene in a severe case of SMA type I. Hum Mol Genet 5: ping of retrotransposon sequences in the unstable region 1971–1976 surrounding the spinal muscular atrophy locus in 5q13. Ge-
- mapping of chronic childhood-onset spinal muscular atro-
zadeh R, Daniels RJ, Byth BC, et al (1990) Genetic homogephy to 5q11.2-13.3. Nature 344:540–541 neity between acute and chronic forms of spinal muscular
- subunit of the transcription factor TFIIH, is involved in ling J, Zerres K, Wirth B (1995) Molecular analysis of candilarge-scale deletions associated with Werdnig-Hoffman dis- date genes on chromosome 5q13 in autosomal recessive spiease. Am J Hum Genet 60:72-79 nal muscular atrophy: evidence of homozygous deletions of Burlet P, Bürglen L, Clermont O, Lefebvre S, Viollet L, Mun-

inch A, Melki I (1996) Large scale deletions of the 5013 $4:1927-1933$
- Genet 33:281–283
In B (1996) Hybrid survival motor neuron genes in patients
In B (1996) Hybrid survival motor neuron genes in patients Bussaglia E, Clermont O, Tizzano E, Lefebvre S, Bürglen L, with autosomal recessive spinal muscular atrophy: new in-
Cruaud C, Urtizberea IA, et al (1995) A frame-shift deletion sights into molecular mechanisms responsible
- Carpten JD, DiDonato CJ, Ingraham SE, Wagner MC, Nieu-
wephujisen BW, Wasmuth H, Burghes AH (1994) A YAC TFIIH transcription factor have homologies with SSL1, a wenhuijsen BW, Wasmuth JJ, Burghes AH (1994) A YAC
contig of the region containing the spinal muscular atrophy
yeast protein involved in DNA repair. EMBO J 13:2393-
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-
- ship to severity? Ann Neurol 41:230-237
DiDonato CJ, Morgan K, Carpten JD, Fuerst P, Ingraham SE,
Prescott G, McPherson JD, et al (1994) Association between
Prescott G, McPherson JD, et al (1994) Association between
Ings i
- spinal muscular atrophy. Am J Hum Genet 55:1218–1229 Melki J, Abdelhak S, Sheth P, Bachelot MF, Burlet P, Marcadet
Dubowitz V (1995) Muscle disorders in childhood, 2d ed. WB A, Aicardi I, et al (1990a) Gene for chronic pro Dubowitz V (1995) Muscle disorders in childhood, 2d ed. WB A, Aicardi J, et al (1990*a*) Gene for chronic proximal spinal muscular atrophies maps to chromosome 5q. Nature 344:
- seau P, Reboullet S, et al (1994) De novo and inherited Francis MJ, Morrison KE, Campbell L, Grewal PK, Christo- deletions of the 5q13 region in spinal muscular atrophies.
-
- Munsat TL, Davies KE (1992) Meeting report: International RNA metabolism? Hum Mol Genet 6:497–500 SMA consortium meeting. Neuromuscul Disord 2:423 –428 Talbot K, Rodrigues N, Bernert G, Bittner R, Davies K (1996)
- lite' sequence. Nucleic Acids Res 15:2537 –2547 phy. J Med Genet 33:1019 –1021
- phenotype: further evidence for SMN as the primary SMA Neuromuscul Disord (in press) determining gene. Hum Mol Genet 5:1727–1732 Theodosiou AM, Morrison KE, Nesbit AM, Daniels RJ,
-
- Rodrigues NR, Owen N, Talbot K, Patel S, Muntoni F, Igna- van der Steege G, Grootscholten PM, Cobben JM, Zappata S,
- Farahani R, Baird S, et al (1995*a*) The gene for neuronal 5. Am J Hum Genet 59:834–838
- JD, Burghes AH, et al (1995*b*) Refined physical map of the recessive spinal muscular atrophy. Lancet 345:985 –986
- Sargent CA, Chalmers IJ, Leversha M, Affara NA (1994) A lation between number of copies of cBCD541 and SMA rearrangement on chromosome 5 of an expressed human phenotype. Hum Mol Genet 5:257–263
- Tranebjaerg L, Skovby F (1997) Quantification, by solidies of the survival motor neuron gene in families with spinal Genet 5:359–365 muscular atrophy. Hum Mol Genet 6:99–104 Wirth B, Hahnen E, Morgan K, DiDonato CJ, Dadze A, Rud-
- gene. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 92:3702–3706 and candidate cDNAs. Hum Mol Genet 4:1273–1284
- Melki J, Sheth P, Abdelhak S, Burlet P, Bachelot MF, Lathrop Talbot K, Ponting CP, Theodosiou AM, Rodrigues NR, Sur-MG, Frezal J, et al (1990*b*) Mapping of acute (type I) spinal tees R, Mountford R, Davies KE (1997) Missense mutation muscular atrophy to chromosome 5q12-q14. Lancet 336: clustering in the survival motor neuron gene: a role for a 271–273 conserved tyrosine and glycine rich region of the protein in
- Nakamura Y, Julier C, Wolff R, Holm T, O'Connell P, Leppert Evidence for compound heterozygosity causing mild and M, White R (1987) Characterization of a human 'midisatel- severe forms of autosomal recessive spinal muscular atro-
- Parsons WD, McAndrew P, Monani U, Mendell J, Burghes A, Talbot K, Rodrigues NR, Ignatius J, Muntoni F, Davies KE. Prior $T(1996)$ An 11 base pair duplication in exon 6 of the Gene conversion at the SMN locus in autosomal recessive SMN gene produces a type I spinal muscular atrophy (SMA) spinal muscular atrophy does not predict a mild phenotype.
- Rodrigues NR, Owen N, Talbot K, Ignatius J, Dubowitz V, Campbell L, Francis MJ, Christodoulou Z, et al (1994) Davies KE (1995) Deletions in the survival motor neuron Complex repetitive arrangements of gene sequence in the gene on 5q13 in autosomal recessive spinal muscular atro-

phy. Hum Mol Genet 4:631-634

5q13. Am J Hum Genet 55:1209-1217 5q13. Am J Hum Genet 55:1209–1217
- tius J, Dubowitz V, et al (1996) Gene deletions in spinal Scheffer H, den Dunnen JT, van Ommen G-JB, et al (1996) muscular atrophy. J Med Genet 33:93-96 Apparent gene conversion involving the SMN gene in the Roy N, Mahadevan MS, McLean M, Shutler G, Yaraghi Z, region of the spinal muscular atrophy locus on chromosome
- apoptosis inhibitory protein is partially deleted in individu- van der Steege G, Grootscholten PM, van der Vlies P, Draaijers als with spinal muscular atrophy. Cell 80:167-178 TG, Osinga J, Cobben JM, Scheffer H, et al (1995) PCR-Roy N, McLean MD, Besner JA, Lefebvre C, Salih M, Carpten based DNA test to confirm clinical diagnosis of autosomal
	- spinal muscular atrophy gene (SMA) region at 5q13 based Velasco E, Valero C, Valero A, Moreno F, Hernandez CC on YAC and cosmid contiguous arrays. Genomics 26:451 – (1996) Molecular analysis of the SMN and NAIP genes in 460 Spanish spinal muscular atrophy (SMA) families and corre-
- betaglucuronidase pseudogene. Mamm Genome 5:791–796 Wang CH, Xu J, Carter TA, Ross BM, Dominski MK, Bell-Schwartz M, Sorensen N, Hansen FJ, Hertz JM, Norby S, cross CA, Penchaszadeh GK, et al (1996) Characterization of survival notor neuron (SMN^T) gene deletions in asympphase minisequencing, of the telomeric and centromeric cop- tomatic carriers of spinal muscular atrophy. Hum Mol
- Selig S, Bruno S, Scharf JM, Wang CH, Vitale E, Gilliam TC, nik SS, Simard LR, et al (1995) Allelic association and dele-Kunkel LM (1995) Expressed cadherin pseudogenes are lo- tions in autosomal recessive proximal spinal muscular atrocalized to the critical region of the spinal muscular atrophy phy: association of marker genotype with disease severity